Ministry of Information and Communications, Bhutan

UNITED NATIONS
Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific

NATIONAL STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION AND CAPACITY BUILDING WORKSHOP ON DEVELOPMENT OF SUSTAINABLE AND INCLUSIVE TRANSPORT POLICY

REPORT OF THE WORKSHOP
9-10 April 2015
Thimphu, Bhutan

This report has been issued without formal editing.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Proceedings of the Workshop</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Conclusions and Recommendations</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Concluding Session</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex I: Programme of the Workshop</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex II: List of participants</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I. INTRODUCTION

A. Background

The Rio+20 Summit renewed global commitment to sustainable development and recognized that transport and mobility are central to sustainable development. In order to fulfill these commitments, Asian countries and cities need to adopt and implement various innovative policies, strategies and approaches thereby ensuring economic, environmental and social sustainability of transportation systems. The summit also urged United Nations regional commissions to prioritize sustainable development through, inter alia, more efficient and effective capacity-building, development and implementation of regional and national policy frameworks as appropriate, and exchange of information, best practices and lessons learned.

In this context the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) is implementing a programme to promote sustainable and inclusive transport policies in the developing countries in Asia. As part of this programme, on the request of the Ministry of Information and Communications (MoIC), Bhutan, a national consultation workshop was organized in Thimphu, Bhutan.

B. Organization of the workshop

The National Stakeholders’ Consultation and Capacity Building Workshop on Development of Sustainable and Inclusive Transport Policy was held in Thimphu, Bhutan from 9 to 10 April 2015. The Workshop was organized by the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) and GIZ in collaboration with the Ministry of Information and Communications (MoIC), Bhutan.

The workshop objectives were to: (i) showcase various regional and global initiatives and policy options for development of sustainable and inclusive transport systems; (ii) share ideas, issues and experiences in building better, more sustainable and inclusive transportation systems and services; and (iii) work towards developing/refining a sustainable and inclusive transport policy for Bhutan. The programme of the Workshop is attached as Annex I to this report.

C. Attendance

The Workshop was attended by 52 multi-sector stakeholders representing various offices in Bhutan and resources persons. The participants included representatives of the MoIC, Ministry of Agriculture and Forests, Ministry of Home & Cultural, Ministry of Labour & Human Resources, Royal Bhutan Police, Department of Roads, Department of Civil Aviation, Road Safety and Transport Authority, National Environment Commission, Bhutan Postal Corporation, Gross National Happiness Commission Secretariat, Thimphu Municipality Thromde), Truckers Association and United Nations Development Programme. The list of participants is attached as Annex II to this report.

D. Opening of the workshop

1. Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC, delivered an opening statement. He mentioned that the organization of this consultation workshop was very timely as the Ministry was
currently considering short term, medium term and long term vision and strategies for development of transport system as an enabler of economic development.

2. Mr. Madan B. Regmi, Economic Affairs Officer, ESCAP, highlighted the objectives of the workshop and invited stakeholders to interact with the resource persons, engage in discussions and utilize the opportunity provided by the workshop.

3. H.E. Lyonpo D.N. Dhungyel, Minister, MoIC, inaugurated the workshop. He mentioned that due to the topography Bhutan transportation system is limited to surface and air transport. He outlined that growing number of vehicles, congestion, emissions, and road accidents as some of the challenges faced by the transport sector. It was mentioned that the Ministry was working to develop a boarder policy framework to address the challenges by utilizing re-emerging technologies and through an integrated approach, which is currently dispersed and un-coordinated.

II. PROCEEDINGS OF THE WORKSHOP

National experts and resources persons made presentations mentioned below. Each session was followed by active questions and answers sessions.

The statements and presentations made are available at: http://www.unescap.org/events/national-stakeholder-consultation-and-capacity-building-workshop-development-sustainable-and

A brief account of presentations made during each session is presented below.

**Session 1. Global and regional overview of sustainable transport policies**

(Session chair Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC)

1. The first presentation in this session was made by Mr. Madan B. Regmi. His presentation highlighted the renewed commitment expressed by member countries for transport and mobility at the Rio+20 Conference. It highlighted various approaches to enhance sustainability and inclusiveness such as taking integrated approach to transport and land use planning, use of energy efficient technologies, clean fuels and vehicles and promotion of public transport systems. He mentioned that transport related goals and targets are being included as part of the sustainable development goals. Once adopted by the United Nations General Assembly, there would be renewed impetus to implement sustainable transport policies. Outlining various policy options and examples that were being implemented by countries, it was highlighted that combination of policies would be required to move towards development of sustainable and inclusive transportation systems.

2. Mr. Manfred Breithaupt, Senior Transport Policy Advisor, GIZ, delivered a presentation on the concept of sustainable transport: planning and designing for sustainable and inclusive transportation systems. Mr. Breithaupt explained the adverse impacts of growth in motorization in economic, environment and social terms. He shared the urban transport challenges faced by developing cities and provided a comparison of the traditional approach of automobile centered and sustainable approach to improve access. He gave the examples and trends of the failures in urban and transport planning. This was against the background to
strive for more livable and attractive cities. Ingredients such as following the ASI (Activity, Structure and Intensity) approach and going for different lifestyles has been discussed. Integrated land use planning was introduced to be a decisive instrument towards achieving overall sustainability.


(Session chair: Mr. Lham Dorji, Director General, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC)

1. Mr. Sithar Dorji, Senior Planning Officer, MoIC, delivered a presentation on current status of national transport policies, systems and projects in Bhutan. The presentation provided country background and overall national and transport policy context. The presentation highlighted that the main objective of transport policy was to increase access to safe, reliable, affordable, eco-friendly and convenient transport services including land, air, rail, ropeways and waterways. The presentation pointed out that the non-motorized transport system such as walking, bicycles and use of ponies were also used in the country. Further, the presentation covered bilateral and regional trade connectivity issues and eco-friendly transport initiatives. Toward the end, the presentation discussed issues and challenges faced by the transport sector in the country. Key issues included the fragmentation of roles and responsibilities of transport sector which spread over many government agencies, the absence of integrated transport policy, inadequate public transport, rapid motorization, the lack of technical capacity and human resources.

2. Mr. Jangchuk Yeshi, Chief Engineer, Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlements, made a presentation on current status of road transport policies, systems and projects in Bhutan. His presentation highlighted that as a landlocked mountainous country, road is the primary mode of transport and the lifeline of the economy. The first highway was completed in 1961 and the road network currently has expanded to 10,578 km. His presentation showed the significant increase in the level of motorization. He shared various ongoing road projects as contained in vision 2020 milestone, the road sector master plan and the Bhutan Transport Vision 2040.

3. Mr. Kelzang Tenzin, Department of Agriculture, Ministry of Agriculture and Forest (MoAF), presented the current status of rural access policies, systems and projects in Bhutan. In his presentation, Mr. Tenzin defined the farm roads as the roads linking farmland to main roads to enable the transportation of agricultural products and those were more than 1 km in length and served more than 20 households. He further explained about the selection and prioritization criteria of farm roads. Roles and responsibility of MoAF to develop and enforce farm road standards and guidelines, maintaining database of farm roads, coordinating the construction, monitoring key results as well as other crucial roles were highlighted.

4. Mr. Mahesh Pradhan from Thimphu Thromde, delivered a presentation on the challenges in transportation management and financing transportation system in Thimphu Thromde (City). Mr. Pradhan provided background of Thimphu city and highlighted the city’s vision to become culturally vibrant, progressively safe and livable city. He also provided information about public transport which was started in 1970 and all public buses in Thimphu were government owned and currently managed by Bhutan Postal Corporation. Current roles and responsibility of Thimphu Thromde included providing sufficient parking...
space as well as to operate and manage its contract, provide zebra-crossing and cycle tracks, install traffic control devices, provide highway lighting, and construct new roads and their road-side drainage. He also highlighted key issues and challenges faced by the city which included the lack of clear mandates and undefined roles and responsibilities, limited expertise in traffic engineering, lack of long-term action plan, and the need to undertake feasibility studies of non-motorized transport.

Session 3. Integrated transport planning and institutional coordination

(Session chair Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC)

1. Prof. Sanjay Gupta, School of Planning and Architecture, New Delhi, delivered a presentation on the integrated national transport planning and policy formulation. The first part of the presentation focused on defining transport integration, the need for transport integration and the objectives of integrated transport planning. It further highlighted the stages of an integrated transport ladder and the hierarchy of interventions. Various stages of national transport planning were presented. The objectives of an integrated transport policy, institutional issues and various policy barriers were also highlighted.

   The second part of the presentation focused on case studies of policy frameworks in India and Bhutan. The case study on India highlighted the reasons why India was moving towards integrated planning and the existing challenges confronting it. Recommendations of the National Transport Development Policy Committee (NTDPC) were highlighted that followed by a prescription for achieving an integrated transport and logistics strategy. The case study on Bhutan highlighted the transport vision and nine transport strategies. It was followed by various strategies related to road network, civil aviation, and passenger and freight transport strategy. The presentation concluded with imperatives for integration in transport sector, proposed outline of integrated transport objectives for Bhutan and suggestions for actions to be taken in developing integrated transport policies and strategies for Bhutan

2. Mr. Regmi’s presentation on international freight transport, logistics and transport facilitation outlined the roles of transport links, nodes and services in moving freight and highlighted the importance of rail based intermodal services on moving freight more sustainably. The scope of improvement of the freight transport operation was highlighted with the aid of current logistics performance index (LPI) and concept of intermodal transport corridors that encompassed infrastructure, facilitation and operation was introduced. The presentation stressed the need to develop transport and logistics industry in Bhutan. Guidelines for minimum standards and professional codes of conduct for logistics and freight industry were introduced.

   The second part of presentation focused on facilitation issues. The key provisions and benefits of joining seven international conventions recommended in the ESCAP resolution 48/11 were outlined. In the context of Bhutan integrated transport planning, improvement of transport and logistics infrastructure, development of additional transport corridors, harmonization of rules and procedures for transport and trade facilitation, acceding to international transport conventions, promotion of transport and logistics industry by engaging private sector and application of appropriate ICT were some of recommendation made in order to improve international freight transport.
3. **Prof. Shivananda Swamy, Professor, CEPT University**, made a presentation on institutional issues and policy Coordination and Integrated Land Use and Transport Plan: Experience from India. He stated that effective land use should be integrated in transport planning. He gave concerns about population growth and migration growth from rural areas to big cities and how to handle those emerging issues. The integrated and interactive link between land use and urbanization as well as transport planning can solve those mentioned issues. He also explained several important elements for effective land use such as local economic development plan, future economic activity and to make them connect with the transport planning. He shared an idea on ‘designing for desirables/ strategic planning approach’ as an alternate to predict-and-provide approach. Transport development, land management and city development plans should be integrated and considered the size of the city and density of the city to design appropriate operating system. He also categorized city level and local level land use plan to make balance in effective land management, for the development purpose. Development framework should be done through close cooperation and collaboration among relevant agencies. He concluded with emphasizing the need for identifying/establishing a ‘Lead Agency’ and empowering the same for achieving integrated transport objective.

4. **Mr. Breithaupt** gave another talk on institutional issues and policy coordination and integrated land use and transport plan: regional and global experiences. His presentation discussed the status quo of public transport in many developing cities as well as the requirements and expectations of citizens. The presentation elaborated on the main components of integrated urban transport, giving public transport a priority over all other modes on the road, non-motorized transport, creating/conserving of public space, public transport integration, transport demand management (TDM) measures and vehicles and fuels. The full chain of sustainable transport and its financing as well as the need to full integration of sustainable public transport modes was emphasized with the objective to offer attractive options against the use of motorized individual transport.

**Session 4. Regional connectivity and air transport policies**

(Session chair Mr. Sangay Tenzin, Officiating Director, DCA, MoIC)

1. **Mr. Regmi** in his presentation on regional transport connectivity in Asia highlighted the importance of regional transport connectivity to facilitate flow of goods, services, people, data and knowledge. The current status of regional transport connectivity comprising of international highways, railways and logistics centres was depicted highlighting the contribution of connectivity to the sustainable development and the need to make transport connectivity more sustainable. The importance of sustainable maintenance of transport infrastructure was also highlighted.

   He stressed the importance of cross-border physical and operational connectivity and the need to improve physical connectivity to and from Bhutan by roads, rail links to the borders and through construction of dry port and logistics centres. He highlighted the need to enhance the roles of private sector in transport operations and the need to improve operational connectivity by acceding to international transport conventions, concluding and implementing bilateral trade and transport agreements and extending air service agreements.

2. The presentation on air transport planning and policy formulation delivered by **Prof. Gupta** was divided into two parts. In the first part the focus was on describing elements of air
transport system, factors contributing to air traffic growth and air travel markets at different stages of development. It further highlighted the concept of hub and spoke system, various components of an airport and its classification system. Air transport demand forecast approach was presented followed by broad land area requirements for an airport. The second part of the presentation focused on case studies of aviation policy frameworks of India and Bhutan. While presenting the case study on India it presented a broad overview of major airports in India followed by major policy highlights of National Transport Development Policy Committee (NTDPC) of India including preparation of National Master Plan for airports, creation of Civil Aviation Authority, setting up of fully autonomous Accident Investigation and Safety Board etc. The case study on Bhutan highlighted various policy measures such as enhancing safety and security, developing domestic and international air services, upgrading airport infrastructure and strengthening of institutional capacity. The presentation concluded with an emphasis to ensure that air investment plans are responsive to changing traffic demand and it should be seen as an integral component of multi-modal transport system. A network centric approach to planning air transport is imperative and in case of Bhutan all existing and proposed airports should have good integrated land transport connectivity.

3. **Mr. M. Absar Alam, Senior Fellow, Asian Institute for Transport Development (AITD),** spoke on rural connectivity. He mentioned that a sustainable transport system needs a clear approach to strengthen rural connectivity. Farm roads were basically the main rural roads in the country. Despite significant progress in farms roads in terms of its length, the roads were still unpaved and poorly constructed as well as maintained. They were integrated with major roads that connect districts and primary highways. In addition, transport infrastructure further required access of proper transport services to rural population. These services would be able to facilitate access to social infrastructure. Therefore, access to social infrastructure like hospitals, schools and other villages still remained to be provided. In order to achieve inclusiveness and sustainability in transport, rural population needed to be connected with the transportation system. He highlighted that the strategies to achieve rural connectivity require institutional strengthening at national level. Such institution needed to be equipped with proper financing mechanism and supported by technical capabilities. A uniform technical guideline for all the farm roads across the country for construction, maintenance along with a uniform operational manual for rural transportation would be useful. Lessons may be drawn from other countries like India which carried out extensive programme for rural connectivity. It created a central agency to design uniform standards and operational manual, monitoring mechanism had also been developed. Rural connectivity programmes were being implemented by district level of implementation units in the country.

4. **Mr. Buddhi Sagar Lamichhane, Aviation Expert, Nepal,** delivered a presentation on the role of private sector, regulator and air traffic safety issues: Experiences from Nepal. He shared the experiences of Nepal as a landlocked country with air transport providing direct linkages with the global community. After the adoption of liberal aviation policy in 1992, the involvement of private sector increased significantly in civil aviation and became dominant in domestic air transport sector. His presentation showed the use of air transport in Nepal along with passenger and cargo flight was extended into the different purposes like: mountain flight, high altitude search and rescue, medical rescue, sightseeing, filming, survey, development assistance etc. which had contributed positively to the socio-economic development of the country. He shared the view that civil aviation should be regarded as a priority sector. Air transport in Nepal was regarded as the vehicle of tourism development, infrastructure development in remote areas, catalyst of economic activity, job creation, and
social integration. Because of the geographical location of the country, the air transport remained a priority.

He emphasized that involvement of private sector was extremely important for development of air transport. Safety assurance, safety oversight capability, compliance and enforcement of safety regulation need of aviation industry are important aspects of sustainability of air transport industry. Policy harmonization between different modes of transport was essential for the sustainability of transport infrastructure and investment.

Session 5: Sustainable transport systems

(Session chair Thinley Namgay, Director, Gross National Happiness Commission Secretariat)

1. Prof. Shivananda Swamy, Professor, CEPT University, spoke about Sustainable Urban Transport System: Experience of Ahmedabad BRT. The idea of Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system was born in Curitiba, Brazil in 1974. Later, in 1998, the city of Bogota developed BRTS of capacity and quality matched to that of metro rail system, which successfully proved BRTS as a viable and economical rapid transit option for cities in the developing nations. Today, there are about 191 BRT systems across the world, with a total of 5400 km of operational corridors and 35 million plus ridership taking BRT every day. He highlighted that BRTS was a concept, configured with 9 elements to perform as a system to deliver high quality rapid transit service at affordable costs. The elements included running-ways, quality buses, accessible and secure bus stations, passenger information system both at the stations and in buses announcing next bus arrival and next station information, bus priority through area traffic control, pre-board automatic ticketing system, operations plan, ITS enabled control centre and unique branding.

He provided the background of Ahmedabad’s BRTS that the city of Ahmedabad started planning BRTS in the year 2005 and project approval came in the year 2005. Tenders were floated in the year 2007 and the system opened 12 km network for public service in October 2009. Subsequently, in quick succession Ahmedabad expanded network to take it to 82 kms. Today with 150 buses, the system carries over 150,000 passengers daily with average travel speeds of 26 kmph. The success of the system is attributable to the leadership provided by Hon Prime Minister Shri. Narendra Modi. The project ownership was taken up by the Municipal Corporation of Ahmedabad and the partnership it built with CEPT University as technical partner and with the people of Ahmedabad. The project was delivered through network approach and participatory processes. The name ‘Janmarg’, meaning ‘people’s way’ has provided sustainable mobility option to the people of Ahmedabad and has successfully transformed urban-scape along the corridor. It has contributed improvements in accessibility and expanded labour market opportunity to urban poor and also the improvements in quality of air. Janmarg has become a sustainable and inclusive transit system and a model for many other cities in the region to emulate.

With regard to specific local context, Prof. Swamy viewed that full BRTS proposal for Thimphu is not feasible. Alternatively he recommended a ‘Light BRTS’ concept which would have all components of BRTS excluding full segregation.

2. Mr. Alam, Senior Fellow, AITD, delivered his second presentation on vehicle fuel economy and emissions standard. He explained that considering the present status of motorization, fuel economy and emission standards were an important element of transport
policy for Bhutan. He highlighted that the climate change related concerns were also there which may compel Bhutan to adopt these policies. However, the design of emission standards and fuel economy was viewed as the cost effective measures for automobiles manufacturing countries. Import based countries had other options like fee-bates or restrictions imposed on the import of inefficient vehicles as alternative to fuel economy. However, vehicle importing countries may also adopt such policies. These policies were required to be integrated with the trade related policies. In case of Bhutan, design of emission standards may be limited to the available practices like Euro Stage/Bharat Stage. But in the case of efficiency standards, Bhutan could consider allowing the imports of efficient vehicles only. He stated that in addition to having vehicle efficiency standards, there is a need for proper testing mechanism for new vehicles and on-road vehicles. For new vehicles, the testing mechanism of the importing countries like India and Japan may play a vital role but for on-road vehicle, technical capacity requires to be developed. In addition to this, measures such as eco-driving, maintenance of existing on-road vehicles can be considered. While considering policies for fuel economy and emission standards in Bhutan, the existing policies and practices of vehicle manufacturing countries need to be studied and aligned where feasible.

3. **Ms. Thanattaporn Rasamit, Economic Affairs Officer, ESCAP,** provided an overview of the road safety situation, at both global and regional levels. She referred to the five pillars identified in the Global Plan for the Decade of Action which should underpin national road safety strategies and frameworks. These were Road Safety Management, Safer Roads and Mobility, Safer Vehicles, Safer Road Users, and Post-crash Response. She also introduced the ESCAP regional goals, targets and indicators which include the 8 important goals of; make road safety a policy priority, make roads safer for vulnerable road users, make road safer and build forgiving roads, make vehicle safer, improve national and regional road safety system, management and enforcement, improving cooperation and fostering partnership, developing Asian Highway as a model for road safety, providing effective education and awareness raising. Finally, she identified measures and shared best practices that can be done in improving safety in Bhutan.

4. **Mr. Breithaupt** gave a brief talk on planning for non-motorized transport. In his presentation, he mentioned the understanding of Bhutan being the Kingdom of walking. Walking has a long tradition here, due to reduced accessibility many dwellings are still many working hours away from a motorable road. The international revival of non-motorized transport (NMT) and its advantages have been discussed. The presentation showed that it was still timely for Bhutan to move forward with the focus on NMT in order to preserve a meaningful role in the array of transport modes. Planning principals to make this happen have been considered and discussed during the session.

**Session 6: Developing sustainable and inclusive transport policy**

(Session chair: Bhimlal Suberi, Chief Planning Officer, Policy and Planning Division, MoIC)

**Mr. Regmi** gave a briefing on the session to discuss strategies, policies and action plan to address issues and challenges in planning sustainable transport systems. He summarized the key points raised during the various sessions of the workshop and outlined potential elements that could be included while developing a sustainable and inclusive transport policy for Bhutan. After initial discussion it was agreed to continue discussion in plenary. The discussion focused on following four topics: i) overall policy frame work, (ii) road and rural road; (iii) urban transport; and (iv) air transport.
This plenary discussion session concluded with a very active and fruitful discussion session. The outcomes of the discussion are presented in section III. Conclusions and Recommendations of the report.

III. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

After extensive discussions, the workshop recognized that there was a clear need to have a comprehensive and integrated sustainable and inclusive transport policy incorporating all transport related sector.

The workshop recommended including the following priority elements while developing a comprehensive transport policy.

(i) **Elements of overall policy framework**

- Vehicle emissions standards
- Fuel quality standards
- Connecting border towns/cities by rail links from India
- Feasibility study of cable cars and ropeways
- Development of dry port and mini dry port as part of intermodal transport
- Measures to control growth of private cars
- Promotion of transport and logistics industry and private sector involvement
- Promotion of construction industry to address transport demand element
- Introduction of climate resilient transport infrastructure
- Introduction of low emission transport strategy
- Addressing the issues of freight transport.
- Road safety – data collection, monitoring, enforcement, capacity building for crash investigation, equipment to assist in enforcement
- Contemplate scrap age of vehicle.

(ii) **Elements of road and rural road sector**

- Expansion of road network
- Asset management and sustainable road maintenance system
- Improvement of long distance public transport and enhance frequency of services
- Development of new transport corridor along North-South and East West (Southern)
- Rural road policy
- Expansion of rural access, extend reach and reduce walk time to nearest road head
- Explore use of road tunnel and viaduct technology in development of transport infrastructure

(iii) **Elements of urban transport**

- Development of city mobility plan with land use and integrated transport planning
- Policies to strengthen city authorities (Thromde)
• Development of urban transport infrastructure (bus stops, roads, parking areas)
• Development of non-motorized transport infrastructure (walkways, footpaths, cycle tracks)
• Introduce social inclusiveness or subsidy policies for vulnerable group of people
• Improvement of public bus system and services (Light Bus Rapid Transit or priority bus lane where there develops sufficient demand, Light Rail Transit System)
• Policies for expansion of use of electric vehicles and charging infrastructure
• Improve public transport integration and integration with NMT
• Introduction of travel demand management measures
• Policies to change travel behavior
• Introduction of benchmarking of quality of service.

(iv) **Elements of Air transport**
• Planning for more domestic air transport services
• Planning for more international air routes
• Liberalization of air policy/open sky policy
• Demand assessment
• Encourage private sector involvement in aviation sector
• Explore possibility of introducing aviation sports such as para-gliding, hot air balloon, dirigible balloon or airship, drone, etc. with adequate regulatory framework.
• Expansion of terminal area and parking bays for airplanes at Paro
• Explore development of a new international airport
• Consideration and improvement of safety standards and compliance
• Introduction of human resource development policy for aviation sector
• Expansion of air freight services
• Introduction of helicopter service for search and rescue and other emergencies
• Economic regulation
• Develop guidelines on age of aircraft, types of engines (single or double engine).
• Issues regarding the use of non-pressurized aircraft

**Implementation strategy**

The workshop also discussed potential implementation strategy once an integrated sustainable transport policy is formulated. The workshop considered the need to address and integrate fragmented responsibilities of various transport sector agencies by defining clear sector responsibility and ensuring policy coordination. Restructuring and realigning of responsibilities of various government agencies and creating of a ministry of transport was also recommended as part of ongoing organizational development initiative (ODI) to ensure greater policy coordination, implementation and monitoring.

**IV. CONCLUDING SESSION**

The concluding session was presided over by H.E. Lyonpo D. N. Dhungyel, Minister, MoIC. Mr. Madan B. Regmi briefly summarized the outcome of the discussion and conclusions and recommendations made by the workshop. Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC again highlighted the importance and timeliness of stakeholder consultation and outcome of the workshop and informed that the conclusions and recommendations of the workshop would be very useful in developing a compressive transport policy. H.E. Lyonpo
D. N. Dhungyel, Minister, MoIC reiterated the importance of transport sector and assured that the Ministry would work to enhance sustainability and inclusiveness. He thanked participants for their active participation, ESCAP and resource persons for their contribution and hoped that such assistance and support would be continued.
National Stakeholder Consultation and Capacity Building Workshop on Development of Sustainable and Inclusive Transport Policy

9-10 April 2015, 
Jambayang Resort Hotel, Thimphu, Bhutan

PROGRAMME

Day 1: 9 April 2015

0830 - 0900 Registration

0900 - 0930 Opening Session: Welcome and Opening Remarks

- Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC - Introduction and welcome
- Mr. Madan B. Regmi, ESCAP - Highlight and Objective of Program
- H.E. Lyonpo D. N. Dhungyel, Minister, MoIC - Inaugural Address
- Mr. Bhimlal Suberi, Chief Planning Officer, PPD, MoIC - Remarks and vote of thanks

0930-0945 Tea/coffee break

0945 - 1030 1. Global and regional overview of sustainable transport policies
[Session Chair: Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC]

- Global Mandate and Regional Overview of Sustainable Transport Development
  Mr. Madan B. Regmi, Economic Affairs Officer, ESCAP
- Concept of sustainable transport: Planning and designing for sustainable and inclusive transportation systems
  Mr. Manfred Breithaupt, Senior Transport Policy Advisor, GIZ

This session introduced global transport mandates and policies relating to sustainable and inclusive transport development. It presented the concepts, emerging trends and practices in planning and designing sustainable and inclusive transportation systems.

1030 - 1230 2. National sustainable transport, urban and rural transport policies: issues and challenges
(Session Chair: Mr. Lham Dorji, Director General, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC)
Current status of national transport policies, systems and projects in Bhutan
Mr. Sithar Dorji, Senior Planning Officer, MoIC

Current status of road transport policies, systems and projects in Bhutan
Mr. Jangchuk Yeshi, Chief Engineer, Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlements

Current status of rural access policies, systems and projects in Bhutan
Mr. Kelzang Tenzin, Department of Agriculture, Ministry of Agriculture and Forest

Challenges in transportation management and financing transportation system in Thimphu Thromde (City)
Mr. Mahesh Pradhan, Thimphu Thromde

This session introduced existing national, urban and rural transport strategies and policies. It highlighted the issues and challenges faced by Bhutan, major cities and local authorities in developing and implementing sustainable transport policies and projects.

1230 - 1330 Lunch Break

1330 - 1515 3. Integrated transport planning and institutional coordination
(Session Chair: Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC)

- Integrated national transport planning and policy formulation
  Prof. Sanjay Gupta, School of Planning and Architecture, New Delhi
- International freight transport, logistics and transport facilitation
  Madan B. Regmi, Economic Affairs Officer, ESCAP
- Institutional Issues and Policy Coordination and Integrated Land Use and Transport Plan - Experience from India
  Prof. Shivananda Swamy, Professor, CEPT University
- Institutional Issues and Policy Coordination and Integrated Land Use and Transport Plan: Regional and Global Experiences
  Mr. Manfred Breithaupt, Senior Transport Policy Advisor, GIZ

This session elaborated on the principles and elements of integrated transport planning with examples of best practices. It also discussed institutional aspects and ways to enhance coordination among various stakeholders in implementation of integrated policies and projects as one of the challenges faced by country is to ensure policy coordination/harmonization at national, local and city levels.

1515 - 1530 Coffee Break

1530 - 1700 4. Regional connectivity and air transport policies
(Session Chair: Mr. Sangay Tenzin, Officiating Director, DCA, MoIC)

- Regional transport connectivity in Asia
  Madan B. Regmi, Economic Affairs Officer, ESCAP
- Sustainable transport role of technologies, cleaner fuels and vehicles
  Mr. Manfred Breithaupt, Senior Transport Policy Advisor, GIZ
- Air transport planning and policy formulation
  Prof. Sanjay Gupta, School of Planning and Architecture, New Delhi
- Sustainable and inclusive transport policy: Rural Connectivity
Mr. M. Absar Alam, Senior Fellow, Asian Institute for Transport Development
- Role of private sector, regulator and air traffic safety issues: Experiences from Nepal
Mr. Buddhi Sagar Lamichhane, Aviation Expert, Nepal

This session introduced the concept of regional connectivity and ways to improve physical, institutional and operational connectivity to and from Bhutan. It discussed the issues, challenges and policy options for improving sustainability of intermodal freight and air transport.

Day 2: 10 April 2015

0900 - 1030 5. Sustainable transport systems
(Session Chair: Mr. Thinley Namgay, Director, Gross National Happiness Commission Secretariat)

- Sustainable Urban Transport Systems
  Prof. Shivananda Swamy, Professor, CEPT University
- Vehicle fuel economy and emissions standard
  Mr. M. Absar Alam, Senior Fellow, Asian Institute for Transport Development
- Global, regional and national initiatives and policies to improve road safety
  Ms. Thanattaporn Rasamit, Economic Affairs Officer, ESCAP
- Planning Non-Motorized Transport
  Mr. Manfred Breithaupt, Senior Transport Policy Advisor, GIZ

Asian countries and city authorities are finding it difficult to provide sustainable and inclusive transport systems to meet the mobility needs of people as a result of growing transport demand and rapid urbanization taking place in the developing world. This session considered sustainable transport and urban transport issues in Asian context and discuss policies and examples of sustainable transportation systems. It also included examples of urban transport systems such as MRT, BRT, emerging transit options, promotion of non-motorized transport and road safety.

1030 - 1045 Coffee Break

1045 - 1230 6. Developing sustainable and inclusive transport policy (Discussion / Breakout sessions)
(Session Chair: Mr. Bhimlal Suberi, Chief Planning Officer, Policy and Planning Division, MoIC)

- Briefing on the session to discuss strategies, policies and action plan to address issues and challenges in planning sustainable transport systems
  Mr. Madan B. Regmi, Economic Affairs Officer, ESCAP

  Breakaway groups
  Group A  Road transport
  Group B  Rural access
  Group C  Urban transport
  Group D  Air transport

This facilitated session/breakout session discussed and developed strategies, policies and action plan to address issues and challenges in planning and implementing sustainable national, urban and rural
transportation systems. The outcome of discussion was helpful towards developing/refining a sustainable and inclusive transport policy for Bhutan.

1230 - 1330 Lunch Break

1330 - 1545 Group Work presentations and Q&A.

1545 - 1600 Tea/Coffee Break

1600 - 1630 The way forward, next step and closing.

- ESCAP - Way forward and next step
- Secretary, MoIC - Closing remarks.
- Hon'ble Minister, MoIC - Closing remarks

____________________
National Stakeholder Consultation and Capacity Building Workshop on Development of Sustainable and Inclusive Transport Policy

9-10 April 2015,
Jambayang Resort Hotel, Thimphu, Bhutan

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

BHUTAN

Lyonpo D.N. Dhungyel, Minister, Ministry of Information and Communications (MoIC)

Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, Ministry of Information and Communications

Mr. Lham Dorji, Director General, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC

Mr. Karma Galay, Director, Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlement (MoWHS)

Ms. Ugyen Lhamo, Thimphu Thromde, Thimphu City

Mr. Masheh Pradhan, Thimphu Thromde, Thimphu City

Mr. Pema Tashi, Department of Civil Aviation, Ministry of Information and Communications, Paro

Mr. Sangay Tenzin, Department of Civil Aviation, Ministry of Information and Communications, Paro

Mr. Sonam Tshering, Department of Civil Aviation, Ministry of Information and Communications, Paro

Mr. Thinley Namgay, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC

Mr. Phuntsho Wangdi, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC

Mr. Phurba S. Tamang, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC
Mr. Karma Pemba, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC
Ms. Ugyen Lhamo, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC
Mr. Shacha Chap, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC
Mr. Dehdup Tshering, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC
Mr. Bhimlal Suberi, Policy and Planning Division, MoIC
Mr. Khandu Dorji, Policy and Planning Division, MoIC
Mr. Thinley Dorji, Policy and Planning Division, MoIC
Mr. Sithar Dorji, Policy and Planning Division, MoIC
Mr. B.B. Tamang, Truckers Association, Bhutan
Mr. Tshering Nidup, Truckers Association, Bhutan
Mr. Dorji Wangchuk, Truckers Association, Bhutan
Mr. Tshering Dorji, Truckers Association, Bhutan
Mr. Jit Bdr. Gummy, Policy and Planning Division, Ministry of Economic Affairs
Mr. Jangchuk Yeshi, Department of Roads, MoWHS
Ms. Kuenzang, Gross National Happiness Commission Secretariat
Mr. Karma Tshering, National Environment Commission
Mr. Kelzang Tenzin, Department of Agriculture, Ministry of Agriculture and Forest
Mr. Karma, Public Transport Operator
Capt. Chuki Wangdi, Royal Bhutan Police (Traffic Division), Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs
Mr. Tashi Penjor, Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs
Ms. Pem Zam, Department of Trade, Ministry of Economic Affairs
Mr. Sonam Dendup, Administration and Finance Division, MoIC
Mr. Jigme Samdrup, Ministry of Labour and Human Resources
Mr. Tshering Penjor, Research and Evaluation Division, Gross National Happiness Commission Secretariat
Mr. Jigme Tenzin, Bhutan Postal Corporation

Mr. Tshewang Dorji, National Environment Commission

Ms. Eshori Gurung, Bhutan Broadcasting Service

Mr. Sangay Chopel, Bhutan Broadcasting Service

Mr. Tshewang Dendup, Ministry of Information and Communications

Mr. Lungten Tshering, Administration and Finance Division, MoIC

Mr. Tashi Penjor, Ministry of Home and Culture Affairs

Mr. Thinley Namgay, Director, Gross National Happiness Commission Secretariat

----------------------------------

RESOURCE PERSONS

Prof. H. M. Shivanand Swamy, Executive Director, Centre of Excellence in Urban Transport, CEPT University, Ahmedabad, India, E-mail: shivanand.swamy@gmail.com

Prof. Sanjay Gupta, Professor of Transport Planning and Head CASS/GIS Centre, School of Planning and Architecture, New Delhi, India, E-mail: drsgupta19@gmail.com

Mr. Manfred Breithaupt, Senior Transport Policy Advisor, GIZ-SUTP, Eschborn, Germany, E-mail: manfred.breithaupt@giz.de

Mr. Buddhi Sagar Lamichhane, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Culture Tourism and Civil Aviation, Aviation Safety and Civil Aviation Authority Supervision Division, Kathmandu, Nepal, E-mail: bslamichhane@tourism.gov.np

Mr. M. Absar Alam, Senior Fellow, Asian Institute for Transport Development, New Delhi, India, E-mail: alamabsar@gmail.com

----------------------------------

UNITED NATIONS BODIES

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

Mr. Nawaraj Chhetri, Project Officer, Thimphu, E-mail: nawaraj.chhetri@undp.org
UNITED NATIONS SECRETARIAT

Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP)

Transport Division

Mr. Madan Bandhu Regmi, Economic Affairs Officer, Transport Policy and Development Section, Bangkok, E-mail: regmi.unescap@un.org

Ms. Thanattaporn Rasamit, Economic Affairs Officer, Transport Policy and Development Section, Bangkok, E-mail: rasamit@un.org

--------------------------------