Guidelines for measuring tax and commercial IFFs: Feedback on methods from pilot studies

Final event on Statistics and Data for Measuring Illicit Financial Flows in the Asia-Pacific region
Session 7
[7&8 Dec 2022 @ESCAP]

Amandine Rushenguziminega, Project Officer, UNCTAD Statistics
Bojan Nastav, Statistician, UNCTAD Statistics
Outline

Part I Feedback from pilot countries in Africa
Part II Feedback from pilot countries in Asia
PART I

FEEDBACK FROM PILOT COUNTRIES IN AFRICA
Method #1: Partner Country Method Plus

- Valuation: CIF/FOB
- Trade system
- Partner country attribution

- Collaboration with customs experts nationally
- Collaboration with partner-country Customs
- Case-by-case
Method #1: Partner Country Method Plus

- UNCTAD Stat Transport Cost Database: 
  https://unctadstat.unctad.org/EN/

- OECD ITIC Database: 

- Other, e.g., 
  Schuster & Davis (2020): Old dog, new tricks? 
  The fitness of mirror trade analysis to detect 
  illicit financial outflows from Africa (unctad.org)
Method #1: Partner Country Method Plus

- Reliability weighting: unreliable data on quantities -> drop

\[
\begin{align*}
    w &= 1 - \frac{|q_{IM,c,r,p,t} - q_{EX,c,r,p,t}|}{\max(q_{IM,c,r,p,t}, q_{EX,c,r,p,t})} \\
    Inbound_{c,r,p,t} &= w \times (IM_{FOB,c,r,p,t}^{Adj} - EX_{FOB,c,r,p,t}^{Adj}) \\
    Outbound_{c,r,p,t} &= w \times (EX_{FOB,c,r,p,t}^{Adj} - IM_{FOB,c,r,p,t}^{Adj})
\end{align*}
\]
Method #1: Partner Country Method Plus

• More detailed step-by-step process
• Example code in R for initial parts
• Reporting table/scheme (e.g., by industry)

• Use in tandem with method #2: method #1 more as a risk assessment, for detailed measurement apply method #2
Method #2: Price Filter Method Plus

• Valuation CIF/FOB -> see method #1
• Addressing heterogeneity -> seek expert input / break data into homogenous groups
• Clearer distinction between statistical and free-market price filters
• Options in determining variation around central price, $\alpha$
  
  \[ price \ filter = central \ price \pm \alpha \]

• Code, step-by-step guide
Method #3: Global distribution of MNEs profits and taxes

- Sample, data source
- Treatment of negative profits; negative taxes
- Scenarios in model specifications
- Statistically insignificant coefficients
- Code, step-by-step guide
Method #4: MNEs vs domestic enterprises profit shifting

- Multiple data sources, linking
- Missing control group (e.g., no domestic firm in mining) -> entire economy (average)
Method #5: Flows of undeclared offshore assets indicator

• No mandatory declaration of assets (no wealth tax)
• Unavailable or inconsistent data sources

• Alternatives explored
  • OECD tax evasion by individuals work on South Africa
  • Method on remittances
  • Gravity model
Method #6: Flows of offshore financial wealth by country

• International and multiple data sources
• Global-level imbalance provided, country-led national breakdown and refinement?
PART II

FEEDBACK FROM PILOT COUNTRIES IN ASIA
Session 7 – Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan - methods

1. **Applying the methods** – what worked/would work, what didn’t work, related issues?

2. What was/would be the biggest challenge / success applying the methods?

3. How could the **Guidelines (tools)** be improved?